
December 19, 2011

To: Heather Harper, Town of Falmouth
From: Nils Bolgen //
Re: **MassCEC Consultant Options – Facilitation Services to Support Review of Wind Turbine Acoustic Mitigation Options**

*For Discussion Only
Subject to funding approval by MassCEC management.*

The Massachusetts Clean Energy Center (MassCEC) may provide facilitation services to the Town of Falmouth Board of Selectmen to assist in the evaluation of potential mitigation options related to operation of the Vestas V82 wind turbines installed at the Falmouth waste water treatment plant. MassCEC may provide these services in the form of a “grant of services” to the Town under which a facilitation consultant under contract to MassCEC will provide services directly to the Board of Selectmen. In this arrangement MassCEC would manage and pay the consultant but the Board of Selectmen would direct the work, within the framework of the approved scope of services.

Presented here is a description of four potential providers of these services and some background on our process for identifying these firms. We welcome input from the Board as to which firm may best suit the Town’s needs.

Background.

MassCEC conducted a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) process earlier this fall to identify firms that will be available to provide facilitation services on an as-needed basis. We received a robust response to the RFQ from a variety of firms. We evaluated responses against the criteria included in the RFQ – range of services to be provided, experience and qualifications, and overall quality of the response – and selected four firms to be available to provide facilitation services to MassCEC.

We have completed the following additional steps with respect to identifying firms that could provide the requested facilitation services to the Falmouth Board of Selectmen:

- Prepared a draft scope of work with background information for the Falmouth project. The draft scope is included at the end of this memorandum.
- Solicited expressions of interest to work on the Falmouth assignment from all four firms that we pre-qualified to provide facilitation services.
- Reviewed the responses received from all four firms and evaluated these responses with respect to:
 - Business focus and general qualifications for this assignment

- Relevant experience
- Proposed staffing of the Falmouth work
- Hourly billing rates

Review of Firms.

The table below provides information on a variety of characteristics of the four facilitation firms. Our assessment and some process suggestions with respect to the Falmouth assignment are as follows. Please recognize that this assessment is based only upon information provided by the firms in response to the MassCEC RFQ and MassCEC’s specific request regarding the Falmouth work. This should not be construed as a general assessment of the firm’s capabilities and experience.

1. Three of the firms are well-suited for the Falmouth assignment – CLF Ventures, Consensus Building Institute and Raab Associates – based upon their business focus and qualifications. One firm, Consensus Building Institute, appears to be particularly well-suited based upon their levels of experience with (a) engagement processes with citizen participation (as opposed to processes including only institutional stakeholders) and (b) processes related to impacts of completed facilities (as opposed to planning-type processes).
2. One firm, Meister Consulting Group, does not appear to be as well-suited for the Falmouth assignment. The company’s core business is substantially broader than facilitation. For example, a relatively large portion of their work in the Massachusetts region is more related to program planning/development/implementation than specific energy facilities.
3. Due to travel commitments two firms had limited opportunity to submit a detailed response to our request for expressions of interest. Regardless, based upon original responses to MassCEC’s RFQ we believe that there is sufficient information on which to base a selection. Alternatively, we could give all firms until later in the week of December 19 to submit additional relevant information.
4. One firm qualified their response with a notice that their commitment to undertake the work was contingent upon management review. Since that review could take place very early in the week of January 2 we believe that this is not an impediment.
5. We did not request that the firms provide a specific proposed approach for structuring and facilitating the Board’s review process. Rather, we have included a task in the scope of work under which the firm will work with the Board to identify the preferred approach. See task item two in the attached draft scope of work.

	CLF Ventures	Consensus Building Institute	Meister Consulting Group	Raab Associates
Location	Boston, MA	Cambridge, MA	Boston, MA	Boston, MA
Core Business	An affiliate of the Conservation Law Foundation (a New England environmental advocacy organization). Formed in 1997 to foster creative, client-centered environmental solutions.	Provider of planning, facilitation, mediation and public-engagement services since 1993.	Consulting firm with a primary focus on policy development and analysis, market strategy and research, program planning and management, and community-based stakeholder dialogue.	Energy and environmental consulting, facilitation, mediation and dispute resolution firm formed in ~1992.
Interest in the Assignment	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

	CLF Ventures	Consensus Building Institute	Meister Consulting Group	Raab Associates
<p>Qualifications</p> <p>Scale:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High • Moderate • Low 	<p>Energy and Wind Energy Issues: High</p> <p>Process Design: High/Moderate</p> <p>Meeting Facilitation: High/Moderate</p> <p>Stakeholder Input and Dialogue: High</p> <p>Negotiation and Dispute Resolution: Moderate</p>	<p>Energy and Wind Energy Issues: High</p> <p>Process Design: High</p> <p>Meeting Facilitation: High</p> <p>Stakeholder Input and Dialogue: High</p> <p>Negotiation and Dispute Resolution: High</p>	<p>Energy and Wind Energy Issues: High</p> <p>Process Design: Moderate</p> <p>Meeting Facilitation: Low</p> <p>Stakeholder Input and Dialogue: Moderate</p> <p>Negotiation and Dispute Resolution: Moderate</p>	<p>Energy and Wind Energy Issues: High</p> <p>Process Design: High</p> <p>Meeting Facilitation: High</p> <p>Stakeholder Input and Dialogue: High</p> <p>Negotiation and Dispute Resolution: High</p>
<p>Experience and Sample Work</p> <p>Scale:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive • Moderate • Some • Less 	<p>10+ years</p> <p>Extensive energy facility and wind energy siting process experience</p> <p>Some experience with post-operational issues/processes</p> <p>Extensive level of engagement with community stakeholders</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community Outreach and Meeting Facilitation: First Wind, Brimfield Wind Project • Confidential Client – designed and facilitated state-mandated process to assess health and environmental impacts of the client’s facility; worked with client and community to implement solutions 	<p>15+ years</p> <p>Extensive energy facility siting process (including wind) experience</p> <p>Moderate environmental clean-up process experience</p> <p>Extensive level of engagement with community stakeholders</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comprehensive Wastewater Management Plan Falmouth, MA - public engagement process including assessment, workshops, and fact sheets, to help develop wastewater Management plan. • Massachusetts Military Reservation superfund clean-up: mediator and facilitator with public agencies and citizens 	<p>15+ years</p> <p>Extensive energy planning for public entities experience; Extensive energy facility and wind energy siting process experience</p> <p>Some experience with post-operational issues/processes</p> <p>Moderate level of engagement with community stakeholders</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regional Dialogue - Expansion of the Frankfurt Airport • Stakeholder Engagement on Wind Power for Massachusetts Communities – provided assistance to help municipalities understand renewable energy development options. 	<p>20+ years</p> <p>Moderate energy facility siting process (including wind); Extensive environmental and policy process experience</p> <p>Less apparent experience with post-operational issues/processes</p> <p>Moderate level of engagement with community stakeholders</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cape and Islands Offshore Wind - Led the facilitation of a public participation process for Cape Wind stakeholders • Facilitating Wind Siting Workshop co-organized and led three-day workshop focused on developing the capacity to collaborate effectively on wind development policy, facility siting, and related issues.
Proposed Staffing	Mix of Sr. and Jr. Staff	Mix of Sr. and Jr. Staff	Mix of Sr. and Jr. Staff	Sr. staff with possible subcontracting for Jr. staff
Hourly Billing Rates	Moderate	Moderate	Moderately High	High
Overall MassCEC Evaluation	Recommended	Highly Recommended	Not Recommended over the other firms	Recommended

Contracting and Work Relationships.

Upon receiving approval for an award of services from MassCEC management, we will proceed to finalize our contracts and work orders between MassCEC and the selected consulting firm. The work orders will make clear that the firms are to provide services to and for the benefit of the Board of Selectmen. Each work order will have a not-to-exceed budget and a general scope of work. The firms will bill against the budgets on a “time and materials” basis. Any work that goes beyond the general scope of services will be subject to management approval at MassCEC.

Draft Scope of Work.

Background.

The Town of Falmouth, Massachusetts (“Town” or “Falmouth”) owns and operates a Vestas V82 wind turbine at its waste water treatment plant (the “Wind-1 Turbine”). The Wind-1 Turbine went into operation in March 2010 and not long thereafter became the subject of strenuous complaints from some members of the nearby community regarding noise impacts.

Beginning in June 2010 the Town convened a technical team and launched a public process to understand and address the complaints. In summer 2011 the Falmouth Board of Selectmen held a series of public meetings to review and address the matter. As an outcome of these meetings, the Town requested its consulting team (Weston and Sampson Engineers and subcontractor HMMH) to complete an analysis of the costs and benefits of a variety of steps that could be taken to address concerns about noise from the Wind-1 Turbine (the “Mitigation Analysis”). The scope of the Mitigation Analysis is described in the October 25, 2011 Agreement for Engineering Services between the Town of Falmouth and Weston & Sampson Engineers, Inc. The Mitigation Analysis and associated reviews may lead to an action recommendation that would be considered at the spring 2012 Falmouth Town Meeting.

In addition to the services contemplated herein, MassCEC has contracted with DNV Renewables (USA) and Acentech to provide wind technology and acoustic services, respectively, to the Town of Falmouth. These firms will provide a third-party review of the Mitigation Analysis and may further collaborate with the Town and other parties to identify additional useful areas of investigation.

A second Town-owned Vestas V82 wind turbine has been erected at the waste water treatment plant site and is expected to go into operation in December 2011 (the “Wind-2 Turbine”). As of December 2011 the Town has curtailed operation of the Wind-1 Turbine and is allowing operation of the Wind-2 Turbine on a trial basis to gauge community reaction. A third Vestas V82 wind turbine is operating within one-half mile of the waste water treatment plant (the “Notus Turbine”) but is not the subject of the Falmouth Board review process or this scope of work.

Scope of Work.

On behalf of MassCEC, the Contractor shall provide the following facilitation services (the “Services”) to the Town of Falmouth Board of Selectmen (the “Falmouth Board”):

1. Review background materials and interview public officials and citizens to become familiar with efforts taken to-date to understand and address neighbor concerns regarding operation of the Falmouth Wind-1 turbine. In providing this service the Contractor may wish to review documents available at the Town of Falmouth "Wind Information" Internet web site at <http://www.falmouthmass.us/deppage.php?number=426>.
2. Provide advice, options and recommendations to the Falmouth Board on how to structure a process for municipal review and action on the Mitigation Analysis (and other mitigation steps that may be identified as the Town process progresses), including how to incorporate public input into that review.
3. Serve as facilitator for the process to review and act upon the Mitigation Analysis (and other mitigation steps that may be identified as the Town process progresses).
4. Assist the Falmouth Board to weigh technical data and stakeholder input to identify an appropriate mitigation option.
5. Provide advice, options and recommendations to the Falmouth Board regarding additional steps that could be taken by the Falmouth Board and the Technical Team to better characterize and understand the nature and extent of neighbor concerns regarding the Wind-1 Turbine.
6. Attend meetings in Falmouth and Boston and participate on conference calls.

Schedule.

Review of the Mitigation Analysis is expected to begin in early January 2012. The Falmouth Board review process is expected to continue through April 2012.

Deliverables.

The following deliverables will be submitted to both MassCEC and the Falmouth Board:

- I. **Monthly Reports** – Contractor shall submit brief monthly reports no later than the 10th day of each month, summarizing the services provided to the Town of Falmouth Board of Selectmen during the previous month. Monthly reports should document all relevant meetings and phone calls during the previous month as well as any findings or recommendations made to the Falmouth Board.
- II. **Final Report** – Contractor shall submit a brief (i.e. one to three pages) memorandum (the "Final Deliverable") with its final invoice. In this memorandum, the Contractor shall summarize the Services provided and describe any results, conclusions and/or lessons-learned through the course of providing the Services.
- III. **Additional Memoranda and Reports** – MassCEC may request additional documentation for specific services as appropriate and mutually agreed. MassCEC agrees to request such documentation no later than two weeks in advance of the expected due date.